Variations in the mosquito larvicidal activities of toxins from Bacillus thuringiensis ssp. israelensis

7 authors, including:

Z. Ngalo Otieno-Ayayo
Rongo University
13 PUBLICATIONS 58 CITATIONS

SEE PROFILE

Arieh Zaritsky
Ben-Gurion University of the Negev
179 PUBLICATIONS 3,767 CITATIONS

SEE PROFILE

Margaret C Wirth
University of California, Riverside
44 PUBLICATIONS 1,813 CITATIONS

SEE PROFILE

Robert Manasherob
Stanford University
44 PUBLICATIONS 916 CITATIONS

SEE PROFILE

Some of the authors of this publication are also working on these related projects:

Stingless Bees of Migori County, Kenya View project

Water Electrolysis View project

Minireview

Variations in the mosquito larvicidal activities of toxins from *Bacillus thuringiensis* ssp. *israelensis*

Zachariah Ngalo Otieno-Ayayo,[1,2†] Arieh Zaritsky,[1]
Margaret C. Wirth,[3] Robert Manasherob,[1,4]
Vadim Khasdan,[1] Rivka Cahan[2] and
Eitan Ben-Dov[1,5,6*]

[1]*Department of Life Sciences, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, PO Box 653, Be'er Sheva 84105, Israel.*
[2]*Department of Chemical Engineering and Biotechnology, Ariel University Center, PO Box 3, Ariel 44837, Israel.*
[3]*Department of Entomology, University of California, Riverside, CA 29521, USA.*
[4]*Department of Genetics, Stanford University School of Medicine, Stanford, CA 94305–5120, USA.*
[5]*Achva Academic College MP Shikmim, 79800, Israel.*
[6]*National Institute for Biotechnology in the Negev, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, PO Box 653, Be'er-Sheva 84105, Israel.*

Summary

Comparing activities of purified toxins from *Bacillus thuringiensis* ssp. *israelensis* against larvae of seven mosquito species (vectors of tropical diseases) that belong to three genera, gleaned from the literature, disclosed highly significant variations in the levels of LC$_{50}$ as well as in the hierarchy of susceptibilities. Similar toxicity comparisons were performed between nine transgenic Gram-negative species, four of which are cyanobacterial, expressing various combinations of *cry* genes, *cyt1Aa* and *p20*, against larvae of four mosquito species as potential agents for biological control. Reasons for inconsistencies are listed and discussed. Standard conditions for toxin isolation and presentation to larvae are sought. A set of lyophilized powders prepared identically from six *Escherichia coli* clones expressing combinations of four genes displayed toxicities against larvae of three

mosquito species, with levels that differed between them but with identical hierarchy.

Introduction

Mosquitoes cause enormous public health menace by transmitting various tropical diseases and by being a nuisance (Service, 2004). Many species of the genera *Anopheles*, *Aedes* and *Culex* are vectors of, e.g. malaria (WHO, 2006), yellow fever, dengue fever, haemorrhagic fever and lymphatic filariasis (Gyapong and Twum-Danso, 2006). Chemical insecticides used in vector control programmes harm the environment (Tabashnik, 1994) with adverse impacts on man and nature. To deal with these problems and limitations, alternative technologies such as biological control are called for. The Gram-positive spore-forming bacterium *Bacillus thuringiensis* ssp. *israelensis* is the most powerful and environment-friendly component in malaria integrated vector management (Fillinger *et al.*, 2003). This bacterium forms a parasporal crystalline toxic body (the δ-endotoxin) that is widely used as a commercial bio-pesticide against larvae of noxious arthropod species of the suborder *Nematocera*, including mosquitoes, black flies and chironomid midges (Margalith and Ben-Dov, 2000).

The larvicidity of *B. thuringiensis* ssp. *israelensis* resides in at least four major crystal pro-toxic proteins, of 134, 128, 72 and 27 kDa, encoded by *cry4Aa*, *cry4Ba*, *cry11Aa* and *cyt1Aa* respectively, and all mapped on the 128 kb plasmid known as pBtoxis (Ben-Dov *et al.*, 1999; Berry *et al.*, 2002). The level of toxicity depends on the capacity of the target species to activate the pro-toxin by breaking it down into the active toxic components using specific proteases prevailing in the basic larval mid-gut. Subsequent steps involve toxin binding to receptors (Feldmann *et al.*, 1995; Yamagiwa *et al.*, 2001; Boonserm *et al.*, 2005; 2006; Fernandez *et al.*, 2005; 2006; Chayaratanasin *et al.*, 2007), insertion into the membrane and aggregation, leading to the formation of gated, cation-selective channels (Knowles *et al.*, 1989; Aronson and Shai, 2001). Lethality is due to destruction of the *trans*-membrane potential, with subsequent osmotic lysis of cells lining the mid-gut (Knowles and Ellar, 1987).

Despite the low toxicity of Cyt1Aa against exposed larvae, it is highly synergistic with the Cry toxins and their combinations *in vitro* (Wu *et al.*, 1994; Crickmore *et al.*, 1995; Wirth *et al.*, 1997; 2007; Pérez *et al.*, 2005) due to different modes of action (Butko, 2003). The latter are structurally unrelated to Cyt1Aa, but resemble in their membrane-perforating ability (Margalith and Ben-Dov, 2000). The Cry toxins bind to membrane proteins whereas Cyt1Aa binds to the unsaturated phospholipids (Butko, 2003). Cry11Aa, for example, binds to a 148 kDa protein in *Anopheles stephensi* (Feldmann *et al.*, 1995) and to a 65 kDa alkaline phosphatase in cells of the *Aedes aegypti* digestive system (Fernandez *et al.*, 2006). Various combinations of Cry toxins with Cyt1Aa alleviate selection of resistance in the targets (Georghiou and Wirth, 1997; Wirth *et al.*, 1997; 2007).

Susceptibility of mosquito larvae to purified B. thuringiensis *ssp.* israelensis *toxins*

Seven species of mosquitoes that belong to three genera are most commonly used in bioassays to estimate activities of the four crystal proteins and synergies among them (Margalith and Ben-Dov, 2000). Table 1 summarizes all LC_{50} values of purified toxins and their combinations against at least one species of each of the three genera, gleaned from the literature reported to date.

The most conspicuous observations are the huge variation of the LC_{50} values and apparent inconsistencies between toxicities of different larvicidal Cry and Cyt1Aa toxins against various mosquito species obtained in different assays. It can thus be concluded that the materials used in the bioassays dramatically affect the outcome. The toxins are usually purified from different bacterial species (original, recombinant, Gram-positive or -negative) grown under varying culture conditions (medium, time, temperature, aeration) and presented to larvae of varying instars (1st–4th) under varied densities (0.17–10 larvae ml^{-1}) and during various periods (12–48 h). For example (Table 1), toxicity of Cry11Aa against larvae of the same three species was an order of magnitude lower (LC_{50} between 8.6 and 135 ng ml^{-1}) in the hands of one group (Revina *et al.*, 2004) than that (121.5–372.4 ng ml^{-1}) obtained by another team (Delécluse *et al.*, 1995). Strikingly, the respective numbers for *Culex pipiens* alone were 8.6 and 372.4! Similar discrepancies are also true for Cry4Ba, Cyt1Aa and combination of Cry4Aa + Cry4Ba.

In an attempt to further clarify these differences, the data summarized in Table 1 was normalized (Table 2) so that LC_{50} in bioassays against *Ae. aegypti* (to which data are complete) were set in each case to a value of 1.00. Despite some clarifications, many inconsistencies persist. For example, relative toxicities of purified Cry4Aa and Cry4Ba to larvae of four *Anopheles* species vary up to 1900- and 15-fold respectively, whereas against two *Culex* species LC_{50} fluctuates up to about 12- and 50-fold respectively (Table 2). Relative LC_{50} values of purified Cry11Aa against *An. stephensi* vary up to 7.9-fold, whereas against *C. pipiens* they vary up to about 3.8-fold only.

Table 1. Summary of LC_{50} values (ng ml^{-1}) of toxins from *B. thuringiensis* ssp. *israelensis* against larvae of seven mosquito species (three genera).

| Cry/Cyt combination | *Culex* | | *Anopheles* | | | | *Aedes* | Reference[a] |
	quinque fasciatus	pipiens	stephensi	dirus	gambiae	quadrim aculatus	aegypti	
Cry4Aa		251	1296				563	Poncet *et al.* (1995)
	345			159			2390	Boonserm *et al.* (2006)
		400	7400				1600	Delecluse *et al.* (1993)
	980				1170		1360	Angsuthanasombat *et al.* (1992)
	980	400				> 80 000	600	Abdullah *et al.* (2003)
Cry11Aa		268	455				287	Poncet *et al.* (1995)
		8.6	135				10.8	Revina *et al.* (2004)
		372.4	326				121.5	Delecluse *et al.* (1995)
Cyt1Aa		1200	6300				880	Thiery *et al.* (1997)
	400	600	2700				1000	Juárez-Pérez *et al.* (2002)
Cry4Aa + Cry11Aa		110	165				108	Poncet *et al.* (1995)
Cry4Ba		> 50 000	17				145	Poncet *et al.* (1995)
		> 50 000	550				300	Delecluse *et al.* (1993)
	> 80 000	> 20 000				25	61	Abdullah *et al.* 2003
	24 500				790		940	Angsuthanasombat *et al.* (1992)
Cry4Aa + Cry4Ba		36	16				52	Poncet *et al.* (1995)
		63	300				82.6	Delecluse *et al.* (1993)
	180				380		280	Angsuthanasombat *et al.* (1992)
Cry4Ba + Cry11Aa		12 495	196				207	Poncet *et al.* (1995)
Cry4Aa + Cry4Ba + Cry11Aa		84	114				100	Poncet *et al.* (1995)

a. All toxins were obtained by purification (described in each reference). Recorded are only preparations bioassayed against at least one species of each of the three genera.

Table 2. Relative LC$_{50}$ values of purified toxins against larvae of six mosquito species (two genera).

	Culex		Anopheles			
Cry/Cyt combination	*quinquefasciatus*	*pipiens*	*stephensi*	*dirus*	*gambiae*	*quadrimaculatus*
Cry4Aa		0.45	2.30			
	0.14			0.07		
		0.25	4.63			
	0.72				0.86	
	1.63	0.67				> 133
Cry11Aa		0.93	1.59			
		0.80	12.50			
		3.07	2.98			
Cyt1Aa		1.36	7.16			
	0.40	0.60	2.70			
Cry4Aa + Cry11Aa		1.02	1.53			
Cry4Ba		> 344.83	0.12			
		> 166.67	1.83			
	> 1311.48	> 327.87				0.41
	26.06				0.84	
Cry4Aa + Cry4Ba		0.69	0.31			
		0.76	3.63			
	0.64				1.36	
Cry4Ba + Cry11Aa		60.36	0.95			
Cry4Aa + Cry4Ba + Cry11Aa		0.84	1.14			

LC$_{50}$ values from Table 1 were divided each by the one obtained by the same team with larvae of *Ae. aegypti*.

For the sake of completeness, Table 3 summarizes data from five additional publications, all with purified toxins (except one, with spore-crystal powder). They evaluate toxicities against *A. aegypti* only, but of varying larval instars, between 1st and 4th, thus explaining the wide range of LC$_{50}$ values obtained. When purified Cry11Aa produced in recombinant *B. thuringiensis* ssp. *kurstaki* was used against 4th instar larvae of *Culex quinquefasciatus* however, similar values were indeed obtained in two different studies by the same team and some synergy observed with Cyt1Aa (Chang *et al*., 1992; 1993). Toxicity of Cry11A produced in recombinant *B. thuringiensis* ssp. *israelensis* was several-fold higher against 4th instar larvae of *C. pipiens* (Yamagiwa *et al*., 2004).

Toxicity of recombinant Gram-negative bacteria expressing cry *and* cyt

Many more Gram-negative species were engineered to express several *cry* and *cyt* genes in attempts to overcome limitations (such as low efficacy and short residual activity) encountered in biological control of mosquitoes (Margalith and Ben-Dov, 2000). Table 4 sums up results of 14 toxicity studies with 9 such species, 4 of which are cyanobacteria, against larvae of 4 species in all 4 instar stages, fed in variable manners.

Transgenic *Agmenellum quadruplicatum* PR-6 and *Synechocystis* PCC 6803 expressing *cry4Ba* under P_{cpcB} and P_{psbA} promoters respectively, displayed very low

Table 3. Larvicidities of purified toxin combinations from recombinant *B. thuringiensis* against *A. aegypti* (complementary to Table 1).

	LC$_{50}$ (ng ml^{-1}) against *A. aegypti* larvae				
Cry/Cyt Combination	Crickmore *et al.* (1995) (3rd instar)	Pérez *et al.* (2005) (4th instar)	Wu *et al.* (1994) (1st instar)	Park *et al.* (1999) (1st instar)	Beltrão and Silva-Filha (2007) (4th instar)[b]
Cry4Aa	1125				13 010
Cry4Ba	467				120
Cry11Aa	224	236	85	73	1350
Cyt1Aa	1209	1245	60		
Cry11Aa + Cyt1Aa[a]	118 (1:1)	12.3 (1:0.2)	14.8 (1:1)		
Cry4Aa + Cyt1Aa[a]	75 (1:1)				
Cry4Ba + Cyt1Aa[a]	62 (1:1)				
Cry4Ba + Cry11Aa[a]	173 (1:1)				
Cry4Aa + Cry4Ba + Cry11Aa[a]	125 (1:1:1)				
Cry4Aa + Cry4Ba + Cyt1Aa[a]	77 (1:1:1)				

a. Toxins were mixed in the proportions (w/w) indicated in parentheses.
b. Powders of recombinant *B. thuringiensis* ssp. *israelensis* containing spore/crystal mixtures.

Table 4. Comparative larvicidities of recombinant Gram-negative bacteria (excluding *E. coli*), as potential agents for controlling mosquito larvae, expressing toxin genes from *B. thuringiensis* ssp. *israelensis*.

Cyanobacterial strain	Toxin gene(s)	Mode of feeding or (single dose)	Larval species instar	% mortality in 24 h or (LC$_{50}$; cells ml^{-1})	% mortality in 48 h	References
Agmenellum quadruplicatum PR-6	cry4Ba	Sonicated cells (10 mg protein ml^{-1})	*Ae. aegypti* 2nd	ND	45	Angsuthanasombat and Panyim (1989)
A. quadruplicatum PR-6	cry11Aa	2 × 10^7 cells ml^{-1} in 12 h intervals	*C. pipiens* 1st	0	0	Murphy and Stevens (1992)
A. quadruplicatum PR-6	cry11Aa	2 × 10^7 cells ml^{-1} in 12 h intervals	*Ae. aegypti* 1st	45	75	Stevens *et al.* (1994)
Anabaena PCC 7120	cry4Aa + cry11Aa + p20	(Single dose)	*Ae. aegypti* 3rd	(3.3 × 10^5)		Wu *et al.* (1997)
Anabaena PCC 7120	cry4Aa + cry11Aa + cyt1Aa + p20	(Single dose)	*Ae. aegypti* 4th	(3.5 × 10^4)		Khasdan *et al.* (2003)
Ancylobacter aquaticus	Cry4Ba	(Single dose)	*Ae. aegypti* 2nd	(4.1 × 10^7)		Yap *et al.* (1994b)
Asticcacaulis excentricus	cry11Aa + p20	(Single dose)	*Ae. aegypti* 1st	(6.83 × 10^5)		Armengol *et al.* (2005)
Caulobacter crescentus	cry4Ba	(3.2 × 10^9)	*Ae. aegypti* 2nd	16	32.5	Thanabalu *et al.* (1992)
C. crescentus	cry4Ba	(Single dose)	*Ae. aegypti* 2nd	(2.2 × 10^6)		Yap *et al.* (1994a)
Enterobacter amnigenus	cry4Ba	(1 × 10^8)	*Ae. aegypti* 2nd	ND	63–100	Tanapongpipat *et al.* (2003)
E. amnigenus	cry4Ba	(Single dose)	*An. dirus* 2nd	(7 × 10^5) (8.7 × 10^5)		Khampang *et al.* (1999)
P. putida	cry11Aa + p20	(Single dose)	*Ae. aegypti* 3rd	(3.9 × 10^4)		Xu *et al.* 2001
Synechocystis PCC 6803	cry4Ba or cyt1Aa	Soluble proteins (1 mg ml^{-1})	*Ae. aegypti* 3rd	ND	30	Chungjatupornchai (1990)
Synechococcus PCC 7942	cry4Ba	7.5 × 10^7 cells ml^{-1}, daily	*C. restuans* 1st	0	20–90	Soltes-Rak *et al.* (1993)

toxicity (Angsuthanasombat and Panyim, 1989; Chung-jatupornchai, 1990). Using tandem promoters (its own and P_{lac}) in *Synechococcus* PCC 7942 slightly improved the toxicity against 1st instar larvae of *Culex restuans* (Soltes-Rak *et al.*, 1993). Tandem strong promoters (P_{psbA} and P_{A1}) and favourable codon usage in the filamentous cyanobacterium *Anabaena* PCC 7120 raised efficiency of expression of *cry4Aa*, *cry11Aa* and *cyt1Aa* (Wu *et al.*, 1997; Khasdan *et al.*, 2003). The higher level of Cyt1Aa in the clone expressing *p20* as well than without (regulated by the same tandem promoters) indicate that P20 protects *Anabaena* from the deleterious action of Cyt1Aa, as it does in *Escherichia coli* (Douek *et al.*, 1992; Khasdan *et al.*, 2001; Manasherob *et al.*, 2001). Recombinant *Pseudomonas putida* expressing *cry11Aa* was not toxic to larvae unless coexpressed with *p20*, in which case toxicity resembled that of *E. coli* (Xu *et al.*, 2001).

The product of *p20* stabilizes both Cyt1Aa or Cry11A in recombinant *E. coli* (as well as in *B. thuringiensis*; Wu and Federici, 1993; 1995) by a post-transcriptional mechanism; substantially more Cyt1Aa/Cry11Aa was produced in recombinant *E. coli* carrying *p20* than in those without it (McLean and Whiteley, 1987; Adams *et al.*, 1989; Visick and Whiteley, 1991). Some larvicidity was obtained when *cry11Aa* was expressed together with *p20* but not alone (Ben-Dov *et al.*, 1995). Cry11Aa is thus apparently degraded and partially stabilized by P20. Similarly, Cry11Aa alone formed parasporal inclusions in an acrys-talliferous recombinant *B. thuringiensis* species, and higher levels were observed in the presence of P20 (Chang *et al.*, 1992; 1993; Wu and Federici, 1995). Increased production of the fused Cry4Aa-ΔLacZ in *E. coli* when expressed with *p20 in trans* was also observed (Yoshisue *et al.*, 1992).

Toxicity of *cry4Ba* expressed in the ubiquitous Gram-negative *Caulobacter crescentus* varied 100-fold according to the regulatory region constructed to drive its expression (Thanabalu *et al.*, 1992; Yap *et al.*, 1994a). The same gene was also efficiently expressed in *E. coli* and formed phase-bright insoluble inclusions, which were highly toxic to *Ae. aegypti* larvae (Angsuthanasombat *et al.*, 1987; Chungiatupornchai *et al.*, 1988; Delécluse *et al.*, 1988; Ward and Ellar, 1988). Toxicities of Cry4Ba against *Ae. aegypti* and *C. quinquefasciatus* larvae were synergized by Cyt2Aa when their encoding genes were coexpressed in *E. coli* (Promdonkoy *et al.*, 2005).

To test whether bioassays with recombinant strains under identical conditions will reduce variability, the same batch of standard freeze-dried powders that had been assayed with *C. quinquefasciatus* (Wirth *et al.*, 2007) was exploited here to evaluate relative toxicities against *Ae. aegypti* and *Anopheles arabiensis* as well, and the bioassays were conducted with larvae of the same instar raised

Table 5. Toxicities of six transgenic *E. coli* strains carrying combinations of four genes from *B. thuringiensis* ssp. *israelensis* against three mosquito species.

Strains[a] (genes)	Mosquito larvicidal activity, LC$_{50}$ (µg ml^{-1})[b] [relative values][c]		
	C. quinquefasciatus[d]	*Ae. aegypti*[e]	*An. arabiensis*[f]
pVE4-ADRC (*cry4Aa*, *cry11Aa*, *p20*, *cyt1Aa*)	0.6 (0.4–0.8) [0.9]	0.7 (0.6–0.7) [1.0]	3.2 (2.4–4.4) [4.7]
pVE4-ARC (*cry4Aa*, *p20*, *cyt1Aa*)	0.9 (0.7–1.3) [1.1]	0.9 (0.8–0.9) [1.0]	6.2 (5.7–6.8) [7.1]
pHE4-ADR (*cry4Aa*, *cry11Aa*, *p20*)	3.1 (1.2–8.3) [1.7]	1.8 (1.6–2.1) [1.0]	11.2 (8.5–16.0) [6.1]
pVE4-ADC (*cry4Aa*, *cry11Aa*, *cyt1Aa*)	4.2 (2.0–9.1) [0.7]	6.4 (5.8–7.1) [1.0]	20.4 (17.5–25.0) [3.2]
pVE4-AC (*cry4Aa*, *cyt1Aa*)	1.5 (1.2–1.7) [1.2]	1.3 (0.8–1.8) [1.0]	7.0 (4.9–9.4) [5.6]
pHE4-AD (*cry4Aa*, *cry11Aa*)	1.5 (0.6–4.0) [1.2]	1.3 (1.1–1.6) [1.0]	7.5 (5.2–11.3) [5.8]

a. Clones designated pHE4- stem from Ben-Dov and colleagues (1995) and those designated pVE4- stem from Khasdan and colleagues (2001).
b. LC$_{50}$ values represent the results of at least three bioassays performed with the same powder preparation (Wirth *et al.*, 2007). Numbers in parentheses are 95% confidence limits, as determined by probit analysis.
c. Values normalized to LC$_{50}$ against larvae of *Ae. aegypti*.
d. Values taken from Wirth and colleagues (2007).
e. Performed as described before (e.g. Khasdan *et al.*, 2001) but with the same powders as used in Wirth and colleagues (2007).
f. Larvae of *An. arabiensis* were obtained from the National Institutes of Health Sciences, Harare, Zimbabwe. The eggs were hatched and larvae reared to the 3rd instar stage at 28 ± 0.5°C and relative humidity of 70%, on ground dog biscuit and Tetramin Baby Fish Food (Tetra GmbH D-49304 Melle, Germany).

similarly. The powders were prepared identically from each of 15 clones expressing all combinations of four genes (*cry4Aa*, *cry11Aa*, *cyt1Aa* and *p20*) from the same promoter in the same *E. coli* strain (Khasdan *et al.*, 2001). All four recombinants with each of the four genes alone, four out of six with two genes each and one of the four with three gene combinations displayed very low toxicities (if at all) against at least one of these mosquito species. Thus, the more toxin genes are coexpressed in *E. coli*, the higher is the likelihood that it would be effective.

Toxicities of the six clones that displayed measurable LC$_{50}$ values against all three species are recorded in Table 5. Mosquito larvicidities of these clones against *Ae. aegypti* were comparable to those against *C. quinquefasciatus* (1.3-fold more toxic on the average) but significantly higher (5.4-fold on the average) than against *An. arabiensis*. Moreover, the toxicity hierarchal order was identical, i.e. pVE4-ADRC > pVE4-ARC > pVE4-AC = pHE4-AD > pHE4-ADR > pVE4-ADC. The results are also consistent with the notion that Cyt1Aa is synergistic to the Cry toxins (Wu *et al.*, 1994; Crickmore *et al.*, 1995; Wirth *et al.*, 1997; Pérez *et al.*, 2005), provided it is co-produced with the helper P20 (Wu and Federici, 1993; Manasherob *et al.*, 2001).

Toxicity of heterologous proteins in recombinant species is usually poorer due to weak expression of the δ-endotoxin genes by the original promoters, low stability and proteolytic cleavage of polypeptides and non-formation or malformation of crystals. The amount of active heterologous proteins expressed depends however, on various additional factors, including regulation of replication (i.e. plasmid copy number), transcription (promoter structure and σ factors), translation (efficiency of ribosomal binding site, U-rich sequence and codon usage) and mRNA stability (stem-loop structure at the 3′

end, and 5′ mRNA stabilizer) (Chandler and Pritchard, 1975; Ikemura, 1981; Studier and Moffatt, 1986; Vellanoweth and Rabinowitz, 1992; Soltes-Rak *et al.*, 1993; 1995; Yap *et al.*, 1994a; Agaisse and Lereclus, 1995; Baum and Malvar, 1995; Dong *et al.*, 1995; Guerchicoff *et al.*, 1996; Liu *et al.*, 1996; Park *et al.*, 1999; 2003).

Additional sources of toxicity variations

In addition to the conditions listed above that can be modified at will and hence reduce bioassay fluctuations, at least two natural features are likely to raise variability of the results, feeding behaviour of the larvae and the structure and density of their gut toxin receptors (not only between different genera but also between certain species of the same genus). For example, surface feeding (at the air–water interface) by *Anopheles* larvae limits their ingestion of the toxin (whether pure or in bacteria), which quickly settles at the bottom of the water body, whereas bottom feeders, such as *Aedes* and *Culex*, filter-feed at all levels of the water column (Merrit *et al.*, 1992; Service, 2004), enhancing the interaction with the introduced toxin. This may partially explain the higher susceptibility and lower variability in LC$_{50}$ values of *Aedes* and *Culex* to the larvicidal proteins than of *Anopheles* (Tables 1, 2, 4 and 5).

Toxicity comparisons with several mosquito species indicate existence of different receptors or of their concentrations on the midgut epithelium. For example (Tables 1 and 2), Cry4Aa displayed high toxicity against *C. pipiens*, less against *Ae. aegypti*, and low against *An. stephensi* (Poncet *et al.*, 1995), but high toxicity against *Anopheles dirus*, less against *C. quinquefasciatus*, and lowest against *Ae. aegypti* (Boonserm *et al.*, 2006). The range of target mosquitoes affected by Cry4Ba differs

from that of Cry4Aa, possibly by using distinct binding sites for interaction with the host receptors (Boonserm *et al.*, 2006), but the specific receptors for Cry4Aa and Cry4Ba still remain to be determined. Involvement of their domains II and III in toxin-receptor recognition/binding has been shown recently (Yamagiwa *et al.*, 2001; Boonserm *et al.*, 2005; 2006; Beltrão and Silva-Filha, 2007; Chayaratanasin *et al.*, 2007).

Concluding remarks

The huge variation of LC$_{50}$ values obtained in bioassays of mosquito larvicidal Cry and Cyt1Aa proteins against various mosquito species seems to result from vast differences in the procedures involved. These can be divided into several categories, strain and growth of the producing bacteria, isolation of the toxins and bioassays conditions, as follows.

The toxin-producing bacteria. These can be either the original *B. thuringiensis* subspecies or recombinant strains. The transgenic species can either be Gram-negative or -positive, the latter from either the same or different genus. Protein folding and solubility are affected by the producer species, which sometimes dramatically modify the final toxicity attributes. Different culture conditions, such as medium composition and pH, growth temperature, mode of aeration and period of cultivation till harvest, all affect the amounts of toxins produced, although not their specific activities.

Toxin purification and processing. The mode of purification depends on the consistency at which the toxin is synthesized *in vivo*. The toxins, produced as crystals in the original species, end up in recombinant strains as inclusion bodies, crystals or soluble proteins. Solubilization methods vary immensely, sometimes require pH shifts, and toxicity level depends on the mode of pro-toxin activation (protease species and incubation conditions).

Bioassays: larvae and conditions. Susceptibility of larvae is age-dependent: 4th instars require an order of magnitude higher concentration to be affected than 1st instars, for example, due to changes in their size and protease composition/contents. Literature-recorded bioassays vary dramatically in the densities of larvae (0.17–10 ml^{-1}) and periods of exposure to the toxin (12–48 h). Food availability, water quality and temperature are factors to be considered.

Acknowledgements

References

Abdullah, M.A.F., Alzate, O., Mohammad, M., McNall, R.J., Adang, M.J., and Dean, D.H. (2003) Introduction of *Culex* toxicity into *Bacillus thuringiensis* Cry4Ba by protein engineering. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **69:** 5343–5353.

Adams, L.F., Visick, J.E., and Whiteley, H.R. (1989) A 20-kilodalton protein is required for efficient production of the *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis* 27-kilodalton crystal protein in *Escherichia coli. J Bacteriol* **171:** 521–530.

Agaisse, H., and Lereclus, D. (1995) How does *Bacillus thuringiensis* produce so much insecticidal crystal protein? *J Bacteriol* **177:** 6027–6032.

Angsuthanasombat, C., and Panyim, S. (1989) Biosynthesis of 130-kilo-dalton mosquito larvicide in the cyanobacterium *Agmenellum quadruplicatum* PR-6. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **55:** 2428–2430.

Angsuthanasombat, C., Chungjatupornchai, W., Kertbundit, S., Luxananil, P., Settasatian, C., Wilairat, P., and Panyim, S. (1987) Cloning and expression of 130-kd mosquito-larvicidal δ-endotoxin gene of *Bacillus thuringiensis* var. *israelensis* in *Escherichia coli. Mol Gen Genet* **208:** 384–389.

Angsuthanasombat, C., Crickmore, N., Ellar and D.J. (1992) Comparison of *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis* CryIVA and CryIVB cloned toxins reveals synergism *in vivo*. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* **94:** 63–68.

Armengol, G., Guevara, O.E., Orduz, S., and Crickmore, N. (2005) Expression of the *Bacillus thuringiensis* mosquito-cidal toxin Cry11Aa in the aquatic bacterium *Asticcacaulis excentricus. Curr Microbiol* **51:** 430–433.

Aronson, A.I., and Shai, Y. (2001) Why *Bacillus thuringiensis* insecticidal toxins are so effective: unique features of their mode of action. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* **195:** 1–8.

Baum, J.A., and Malvar, T. (1995) Regulation of insecticidal crystal protein production in *Bacillus thuringiensis. Mol Microbiol* **18:** 1–12.

Beltrão, H.B.M., and Silva-Filha M.H.N.L. (2007) Interaction of *Bacillus thuringiensis* var. *israelensis* Cry toxins with binding sites from *Aedes aegypti* (*Diptera*: *Culicidae*) larvae midgut. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* **266:** 163–169.

Ben-Dov, E., Boussiba, S., and Zaritsky, A. (1995) Mosquito larvicidal activity of *Escherichia coli* with combinations of genes from *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis. J Bacteriol* **177:** 2851–2857.

Ben-Dov, E., Nissan, G., Peleg, N., Manasherob, R., Boussiba, S., and Zaritsky, A. (1999) Refined, circular

restriction map of *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis* plasmid carrying the mosquito larvicidal genes. *Plasmid* **42:** 186–191.

Berry, C., O'Neil, S., Ben-Dov, E., Jones, A.F., Murphy, L., Quail, M.A., *et al.* (2002) Complete sequence and organization of pBtoxis, the toxin-coding plasmid of *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis*. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **68:** 5082–5095.

Boonserm, P., Davis, P., Ellar, D.J., and Li, J. (2005) Crystal structure of the mosquito-larvicidal toxin Cry4Ba and its biological implications. *J Mol Biol* **348:** 363–382.

Boonserm, P., Mo, M., Angsuthanasombat, C., and Lescar, J. (2006) Structure of the functional form of the mosquito larvicidal Cry4Aa toxin from *Bacillus thuringiensis* at a 2.8-Angstrom resolution. *J Bacteriol* **188:** 3391–3401.

Butko, P. (2003) Cytolytic toxin Cyt1A and its mechanism of membrane damage: data and hypotheses. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **69:** 2415–2422.

Chandler, M.G., and Pritchard, R.H. (1975) The effect of gene concentration and relative gene dosage on gene output in *Escherichia coli*. *Mol Gen Genet* **138:** 127–141.

Chang, C., Dai, S.-M., Frutos, R., Federici, B.A., and Gill, S.S. (1992) Properties of 72-kilodalton mosquitocidal protein from *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *morrisoni* PG-14 expressed in *B. thuringiensis* subsp. *kurstaki* by using the shuttle vector pHT3101. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **58:** 507–512.

Chang, C., Yu, Y.-M., Dai, S.-M., Law, S.K., and Gill, S.S. (1993) High-level cryIVD and cytA gene expression in *Bacillus thuringiensis* does not require the 20-kilodalton protein, and the coexpressed gene products are synergistic in their toxicity to mosquitoes. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **59:** 815–821.

Chayaratanasin, P., Moonsom, S., Sakdee, S., Chaisri, U., Katzenmeier, G., and Angsuthanasombat, C. (2007) High level of soluble expression in *Escherichia coli* and characterisation of the cloned *Bacillus thuringiensis* Cry4Ba Domain III fragment. *J Biochem Mol Biol* **40:** 58–64.

Chungjatupornchai, W. (1990) Expression of the mosquito-cidal protein genes of *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis* and the herbicide-resistance gene bar in *Synechocystis* PCC6803. *Curr Microbiol* **21:** 283–288.

Chungiatupornchai, W., Hofte, H., Seurinck, J., Angsuthana-sombat, C., and Vaeck, M. (1988) Common features of *Bacillus thuringiensis* toxins specific for Diptera and Lepidoptera. *Eur J Biochem* **173:** 9–16.

Crickmore, N., Bone, E.J., Williams, J.A., and Ellar, D.J. (1995) Contribution of the individual components of the δ-endotoxin crystal to the mosquitocidal activity of *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis*. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* **131:** 249–254.

Delécluse, A., Bourgouin, C., Klier, A., and Rapoport, G. (1988) Specificity of action on mosquito larvae of *Bacillus thuringiensis* var. *israelensis* toxins encoded by two different genes. *Mol Gen Genet* **214:** 42–47.

Delécluse, A., Poncet, S., Klier, A., and Rapoport, G. (1993) Expression of *cryIVA* and *cryIVB* genes, independently or in combination, in a crystal-negative strain of *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis*. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **59:** 3922–3927.

Delécluse, A., Rosso, M.-L., and Ragni, A. (1995) Cloning

and expression of a novel toxin gene from *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *jegathesan* encoding a highly mosquitocidal protein. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **61:** 4230–4235.

Dong, H., Nilsson, L., and Kurland, C.G. (1995) Gratuitous overexpression of genes in *Escherichia coli* leads to growth inhibition and ribosome destruction. *J Bacteriol* **177:** 1497–1504.

Douek, J., Einav, M., and Zaritsky, A. (1992) Sensitivity to plating of *Escherichia coli* cells expressing the *cytA* gene from *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis*. *Mol Gen Genet* **232:** 162–165.

Feldmann, F., Dullemans, A., and Waalwijk, C. (1995) Binding of the CryIVD toxin of *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis* to larval dipteran midgut proteins. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **61:** 2601–2605.

Fernandez, L.E., Perez, C., Segovia, L., Rodriguez, M.H., Gill, S.S., Bravo, A., and Soberon, M. (2005) Cry11Aa toxin from *Bacillus thuringiensis* binds its receptor in *Aedes aegypti* mosquito larvae through loop α-8 of domain II. *FEBS Lett* **579:** 3508–3514.

Fernandez, L.E., Aimanova, K.G., Gill, S.S., Brovo, A., and Soberon, M. (2006) A GPI-anchored alkaline phosphatase is a functional midgut receptor of Cry11Aa toxin in *Aedes aegypti* larvae. *Biochem J* **394:** 77–84.

Fillinger, U., Knols, B.G.J., and Becker, N. (2003) Efficacy and efficiency of new *Bacillus thuringiensis* var. *israelensis* and *Bacillus sphaericus* formulations against Afrotropical anophelines in Western Kenya. *Trop Med Int Health* **8:** 37–47.

Georghiou, G.P., and Wirth, M.C. (1997) Influence of exposure to single versus multiple toxins of *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis* on development of resistance in the mosquito *Culex quinquefasciatus* (Diptera: Culicidae). *Appl Environ Microbiol* **63:** 1095–1101.

Guerchicoff, A., Rubinstein, C.P., and Ugalde, R.A. (1996) Introduction and expression of an anti-dipteran toxin gene from *B. thuringiensis* in nodulating *Rhizobia*. *Cell Mol Biol* **42:** 729–735.

Gyapong, J.O., and Twum-Danso, N.A.Y. (2006) Editorial: global elimination of lymphatic filariasis: fact or fantasy? *Trop Med Int Health* **11:** 125–128.

Ikemura, T. (1981) Correlation between abundance of *Escherichia coli* tRNAs and the occurrence of the respective codons in its protein genes. *J Mol Biol* **146:** 1–21.

Juárez-Pérez, V., Guerchicoff, A., Rubinstein, C., and Delécluse, A. (2002) Characterization of Cyt2Bc toxin from *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *medellin*. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **68:** 1228–1231.

Khampang, P., Chungjatupornchai, W., Luxananil, P., and Panyim, S. (1999) Efficient expression of mosquito-larvicidal proteins in a gram-negative bacterium capable of recolonization in the guts of *Anopheles dirus* larva. *Appl Microbiol Biotechnol* **51:** 79–84.

Khasdan, V., Ben-Dov, E., Manasherob, R., Boussiba, S., and Zaritsky, A. (2001) Toxicity and synergism in transgenic *Escherichia coli* expressing four genes from *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis*. *Environ Microbiol* **3:** 798–806.

Khasdan, V., Ben-Dov, E., Manasherob, R., Boussiba, S., and Zaritsky, A. (2003) Mosquito larvicidal activity of transgenic *Anabaena* PCC 7120 expressing toxin genes from

Bacillus thuringiensis ssp. *israelensis. FEMS Microbiol Lett* **227:** 189–195.

Knowles, B., and Ellar, D.J. (1987) Colloid-osmotic lysis is a general feature of the mechanism of action of *Bacillus thuringiensis* δ-endotoxin with different insect specificities. *Biochim Biophys Acta* **924:** 509–518.

Knowles, B.H., Blatt, M.R., Tester, M., Horsnell, J.M., Carroll, J., Menestrina, G., and Ellar, D.J. (1989) A cytolytic δ-endotoxin from *Bacillus thuringiensis* var. *israelensis* forms cation-selective channels in planar lipid bilayers. *FEBS Lett* **244:** 259–262.

Liu, J.-W., Yap, W.H., Thanabalu, T., and Porter, A.G. (1996) Efficient synthesis of mosquitocidal toxins in *Asticcacaulis excentricus* demonstrates potential of gram-negative bacteria in mosquito control. *Nat Biotechnol* **14:** 343–347.

McLean, K.M., and Whiteley, H.R. (1987) Exspression in *Escherichia coli* of a cloned crystal protein gene of *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis. J Bacteriol* **169:** 1017–1023.

Manasherob, R., Zaritsky, A., Ben-Dov, E., Saxena, D., Barak, Z., and Einav, M. (2001) Effect of accessory proteins P19 and P20 on cytolytic activity of Cyt1Aa from *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis* in *Escherichia coli. Curr Microbiol* **43:** 355–364.

Margalith, Y., and Ben-Dov, E. (2000) Biological control by *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis*. In *Insect Pest Management: Techniques for Environmental Protection*. Recheigl, J.E., and Recheigl, N.A. (eds). Boca Raton, FL, USA: CRC Press LLC, pp. 243–301.

Merritt, R.W., Dadd, R.H., and Walker, E.D. (1992) Feeding behavior, natural food, and nutritional relationships of larval mosquitoes. *Annu Rev Entomol* **37:** 349–376.

Murphy, R.C., and Stevens, S.E., Jr (1992) Cloning and expression of the *cryIVD* gene of *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis* in the cyanobacterium *Agmenellum quadruplicatum* PR-6 and its resulting larvicidal activity. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **58:** 1650–1655.

Park, H.-W., Bideshi, D.K., Johnson, J.J., and Federici, B.A. (1999) Differential enhancement of Cry2A versus Cry11A yields in *Bacillus thuringiensis* by use of the *cry3A* STAB mRNA sequence. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* **181:** 319–327.

Park, H.-W., Bideshi, D.K., and Federici, B.A. (2003) Recombinant strain of *Bacillus thuringiensis* producing Cyt1A, Cry11B, and the *Bacillus sphaericus* binary toxin. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **69:** 1331–1334.

Pérez, C., Fernandez, L.E., Sun, J., Folch, J.L., Gill, S.S., Soberón, M., and Bravo, A. (2005) *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis* Cyt1Aa synergizes Cry11Aa toxin by functioning as a membrane-bound receptor. *Proc Natnl Acad Sci USA* **102:** 18303–18308.

Poncet, S., Delécluse, A., Klier, A., and Rapoport, G. (1995) Evaluation of synergistic interactions among the CryIVA, CryIVB and CryIVD toxic components of *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis* crystals. *J Invertebr Pathol* **66:** 131–135.

Promdonkoy, B., Promdonkoy, P., and Panyim, S. (2005) Co-expression of *Bacillus thuringiensis* Cry4Ba and Cyt2Aa2 in *Escherichia coli* revealed high synergism against *Aedes aegypti* and *Culex quinquefasciatus* larvae. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* **252:** 121–126.

Revina, L.P., Kostina, L.I., Ganushkina, L.A., Mikhailova, A.L., Zalunin, I.A., and Chestukhina, G.G. (2004) Reconstruction of *Bacillus thuringiensis* ssp. *israelensis* Cry11A endotoxin from fragments corresponding to its N- and C-moieties restores its original biological activity. *Biochemistry (Moscow)* **69:** 181–187.

Service, M.W. (2004) *Medical Entomology for Students*, 3rd edn. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Soltes-Rak, E., Kushner, D.J., Williams, D.D., and Coleman, J.R. (1993) Effect of promoter modification on mosquitocidal *cryIVB* gene expression in *Synechococcus* sp. strain PCC 7942. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **59:** 2404–2410.

Soltes-Rak, E., Kushner, D.J., Williams, D.D., and Coleman, J.R. (1995) Factors regulating *cryIVB* expression in the cyanobacterium *Synechococcus* PCC 7942. *Mol Gen Genet* **246:** 301–308.

Stevens, S.E., Jr, Murphy, R.C., Lamoreaux, W.J., and Coons, L.B. (1994) A genetically engineered mosquitocidal cyanobacterium. *J Appl Phycol* **6:** 187–197.

Studier, F.W., and Moffatt, B.A. (1986) Use of bacteriophage T7 RNA polymerase to direct selective high-level expression of cloned genes. *J Mol Biol* **189:** 113–130.

Tabashnik, B.E. (1994) Evaluation of resistance to *Bacillus thuringiensis. Annu Rev Entomol* **39:** 47–49.

Tanapongpipat, S., Nantapong, N., Cole, J., and Panyim, S. (2003) Stable integration and expression of mosquito-larvicidal genes from *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis* and *Bacillus sphaericus* into the chromosome of *Enterobacter amnigenus*: a potential breakthrough in mosquito biocontrol. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* **221:** 243–248.

Thanabalu, T., Hindley, J., Brenner, S., Oei, C., and Berry, C. (1992) Expression of the mosquitocidal toxins of *Bacillus sphaericus* and *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis* by recombinant *Caulobacter crescentus*, a vehicle for biological control of aquatic insect larvae. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **58:** 905–910.

Thiery, I., Delécluse, A., Tamayo, M.C., and Orduz, S. (1997) Identification of a gene for Cyt1A-like hemolysin from *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *medellin* and expression in a cystal-ngative *B. thuringiensis* strain. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **63:** 468–473.

Vellanoweth, R.L., and Rabinowitz, J.C. (1992) The influence of ribosome-binding-site elements on translational efficacy in *Bacillus subtilis* and *Escherichia coli in vivo. Mol Microbiol* **6:** 1105–1114.

Visick, J.E., and Whiteley, H.R. (1991) Effect of a 20-kilodalton protein from *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis* on production of the CytA protein by *Escherichia coli. J Bacteriol* **173:** 1748–1756.

Ward, S., and Ellar, D. (1988) Cloning and expression of two homologous genes of *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis* which encode 130-kilodalton mosquitocidal proteins. *J Bacteriol* **170:** 727–735.

WHO (2006) Malaria vector control and personal protection: report of a WHO study group. Geneva, 10–12 March 2004. Technical Report Series 936.

Wirth, M.C., Georghiou, G.P., and Federici, B.A. (1997) CytA enables CryIV endotoxins of *Bacillus thuringiensis* to overcome high levels of CryIV resistance in the mosquito, *Culex quinquefasciatus. Proc Natnl Acad Sci USA* **94:** 10536–10540.

Wirth, M.C., Zaritsky, A., Ben-Dov, E., Manasherob, R.,

Khasdan, V., Boussiba, S., and Walton, W.E. (2007) Cross-resistance spectra of *Culex quinquefasciatus* resistant to mosquitocidal toxins of *Bacillus thuringiensis* towards recombinant *Escherichia coli* expressing genes from *B. thuringiensis* ssp. *israelensis*. *Environ Microbiol* **9:** 1393–1401.

Wu, D., and Federici, B.A. (1993) A 20-kilodalton protein preserves cell viability and promotes CytA crystal formation during sporulation in *Bacillus thuringiensis*. *J Bacteriol* **175:** 5276–5280.

Wu, D., and Federici, B.A. (1995) Improved production of the insecticidal CryIVD protein in *Bacillus thuringiensis* using *crylA (c)* promoters to express the gene for an associated 20-kDa protein. *Appl Microbiol Biotechnol* **45:** 697–702.

Wu, D., Johnson, J.J., and Federici, B.A. (1994) Synergism of mosquitocidal toxicity between CytA and CryIVD proteins using inclusions produced from cloned genes of *Bacillus thuringiensis*. *Mol Microbiol* **13:** 965–972.

Wu, X., Vennison, S.J., Liu, H., Ben-Dov, E., Zaritsky, A., and Boussiba, S. (1997) Mosquito larvicidal activity of transgenic *Anabaena* strain PCC 7120 expressing combinations of genes from *Bacillus thuringiensis* subsp. *israelensis*. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **63:** 1533–1537.

Xu, Y., Nagai, M., Bagdasarian, M., Smith, T.W., and Walker, E.D. (2001) Expression of the *p20* gene from *Bacillus thu-*
ringiensis H-14 increases Cry11A toxin production and enhances mosquito-larvicidal activity in recombinant gram-negative bacteria. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **67:** 3010–3015.

Yamagiwa, M., Kamauchi, S., Okegawa, T., Esaki, M., Otake, K., Amachi, T., *et al.* (2001) Binding properties of *Bacillus thuringiensis* Cry4A toxin to the apical microvilli of larval midgut of *Culex pipiens*. *Biosci Biotechnol Biochem* **65:** 2419–2427.

Yamagiwa, M., Sakagawa, K., and Sakai, H. (2004) Functional analysis of two processed fragments of *Bacillus thuringiensis* Cry11A toxin. *Biosci Biotechnol Biochem* **68:** 523–528.

Yap, W.H., Thanabalu, T., and Porter, A.G. (1994a) Influence of transcriptional and translational control sequences on the expression of foreign genes in *Caulobacter crescentus*. *J Bacteriol* **176:** 2603–2610.

Yap, W.H., Thanabalu, T., and Porter, A.G. (1994b) Expression of mosquitocidal toxin genes in a gas-vacuolated strain of *Ancylobacter aquaticus*. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **60:** 4199–4202.

Yoshisue, H., Yoshida, K.-I., Sen, K., Sakai, H., and Komano, T. (1992) Effects of *Bacillus thuringiensis* var. *israelensis* 20-kDa prorein on production of the *Bti* 130-kDa crystal protein in *Escherichia coli*. *Biosci Biotechnol Biochem* **56:** 1429–1433.